

East Area Planning Committee

7th September 2016

Application Number: 16/01402/FUL

Decision Due by: 12th September 2016

Proposal: Removal of the existing pitched roof, a new reception area with 2 additional bedrooms over, an off-site constructed second storey to house 20 new bedrooms and associated external works.

Site Address: St Luke's Hospital Latimer Road – see **Appendix 1**

Ward: Headington Ward

Agent: Mr Dan Boucher

Applicant: Mr Richard Burden

Recommendation:

Officers recommend that the East Area Planning Committee approves the application subject to conditions.

Reasons for Approval

- 1 Officers have considered carefully all objections to these proposals. Officers have come to the view, for the detailed reasons set out in the officers report, that the objections do not amount, individually or cumulatively, to a reason for refusal and that all the issues that have been raised have been adequately addressed and the relevant bodies consulted.
- 2 The Council considers that the proposal accords with the policies of the development plan as summarised below. It has taken into consideration all other material matters, including matters raised in response to consultation and publicity. Any material harm that the development would otherwise give rise to can be offset by the conditions imposed.

Conditions

- 1 Development begun within time limit
- 2 Develop in accordance with approved plans
- 3 Samples
- 4 Tree Protection Plan (TPP) 2

- 5 Landscape plan
- 6 Landscape management plan
- 7 Details of photovoltaics
- 8 Drainage strategy
- 9 Land quality risk assessment
- 10 Land quality report
- 11 Parking plan
- 12 Cycle parking
- 13 Shower and lockers - cyclists
- 14 Construction Travel Plan

Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL)

This application is liable for CIL.

Principal Planning Policies:

Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016

- CP1** - Development Proposals
- CP6** - Efficient Use of Land & Density
- CP8** - Design Developmt to Relate to its Context
- CP9** - Creating Successful New Places
- CP10** - Siting Developmnt to Meet Functionl Needs
- CP11** - Landscape Design
- CP13** - Accessibility
- CP22** - Contaminated Land
- TR3** - Car Parking Standards
- TR4** - Pedestrian & Cycle Facilities
- NE14** - Water and Sewerage Infrastructure
- NE15** - Loss of Trees and Hedgerows
- NE16** - Protected Trees

Core Strategy

- CS2_** - Previously developed and greenfield land
- CS9_** - Energy and natural resources
- CS18_** - Urb design, town character, historic env

Sites and Housing Plan

HP14_ - Privacy and Daylight

HP16_ - Residential car parking

Public Consultation

Statutory Consultees.

- Highways Authority: Objection due to: safety, access and car parking compromised due to limited highway space; Impact/consideration of on-site visitor car parking; Adequacy of cycle parking provision, particularly for visitors; Construction traffic impact. Conditions have been recommended in order to overcome these objections.
- Thames Water Utilities Limited: conditions recommended relating to waste, surface water drainage and water infrastructure capacity.
- Environment Agency Thames Region: no comments received

Individual Comments:

3 Brookside – objection (two representations received):

- Second floor south-west elevation – its height, bedroom windows and staff room – will harm privacy and views;
- Overdevelopment;
- Overstretched infrastructure and overloaded road system.

Pre-application consultations by applicant

A consultation event was held in February 2016 with invitations being sent to resident groups and the residents along Latimer Road, All Saints Road and Brookside. Patients and staff of St Luke's, local residents, and a local councillor attended. A further event was held at McMaster House in April 2016 to tackle residents' concerns about the design.

An early iteration of the design was presented to the Oxford Design Review Panel (ODRP) in March 2016 – see **Appendix 2** for the ODRP response. The comments from the ODRP are included in the relevant sections of this report.

Relevant Site History

98/01210/NF - External modifications to north and east elevations in connection with provision of 4 additional patient bedrooms. Removal of raised landscape beds and rationalisation of car park to create 21 car parking spaces (Amended plans).
Approved 28th October 1998

98/01282/NF - New pitch roof to existing building (Amended Plans). Approved 28th October 1998

14/02869/FUL - Remove raised flower bed. Provision of 5 additional car parking spaces. Approved 10th December 2014

Officers Assessment:

Background to Proposals

1. St Luke's Hospital is a care home providing long-term care as well as some short-stay rehabilitation, respite and end-of-life care. It was originally built in the 1980s with the linked building, McMaster House, which provides sheltered housing accommodation; this is now under separate management.
2. The hospital is accessed from Latimer Road and the site is enclosed by McMaster House, residential housing in The Brambles, Brookside, and on Latimer Road, and by Headington Preparatory School to the north-west.
3. In order to upgrade the long-term care bedrooms to current space and market standards, and to maintain a cost-effective number of bedrooms to manage, St Luke's is seeking to upgrade and expand the building.
4. A pre-fabricated additional storey across most of the footprint of the building, housing 20 new bedrooms, is proposed to be added to the building. This would replace the failing metal roof. The entrance is proposed to be extended and reoriented to face Latimer Road with two additional bedrooms provided at first-floor level above the entrance. Various landscaping works are proposed with a reconfiguration of car parking. Internal works are planned to reduce the number of first-floor beds from 29 to 23 and upgrade the bedrooms. Additional facilities including a garden room, staff rooms and staff changing rooms with showers are proposed.
5. Officers consider the principal determining issues to be:
 - Principle of development
 - Form and visual impact
 - Residential amenity
 - Trees and landscaping
 - Highways and transport
 - Drainage
 - Sustainability
 - Other matters

Principle of development

6. Policy CS2 of the Oxford Core Strategy states that development will be focused on previously developed land. The expansion of the existing care home at St Luke's Hospital would be consistent with this policy and therefore acceptable in principle.

Form and visual impact

7. The development would remove the existing metal roof from the building. The pre-fabricated structure would be added to the southerly part of the building with the remaining roof area being converted to a sedum roof. The additional mass would be a third storey across much of the existing building with the lift overrun and water tank storage creating taller elements. Photovoltaics and a green roof would be installed on the new flat roof of the pre-fabricated structure.
8. The pre-fabricated structure needs to be supported in places and the support frame will be visible externally against the original building. The form of the additional storey is orthogonal and flat-roofed incorporating living walls, with metal cladding panels, contrasting metal flashing and flush faced aluminium windows proposed as materials. The resulting appearance of the development is of a contemporary 'wrapping' of the original building.
9. The ODRP's comments relating to building design included:

To create a strong, refreshed identity for St Luke's Hospital the pre-fabricated structure should look and feel like a new, high quality building element. ... We suggest creating a new structure that could be read as a distinct element complementing the original design. ... Introducing a flat roof to incorporate a green roof and photovoltaics would help achieve a calmer and less obtrusive building in this context and enhance the overall character of the site, as well as enhancing its sustainability. The new building element could overhang the existing building and we suggest highlighting, as opposed to hiding, the new structural columns to achieve the new identity.

10. Officers consider that the design submitted with this application has achieved the objectives set by the ODRP in creating a positive and contemporary redesign of the building. The addition of vegetation via the living walls and green roofs gives a sense of identity, and softens and complements the orthogonal design. The reorientation of the entrance makes a more positive and legible contribution to the street scene by facing Latimer Road.
11. The additional massing is considered appropriate and would integrate comfortably in the immediate area, considering the gaps between the existing building and the surrounding sites, the mix of residential and institutional uses in the area, and the height and massing of surrounding buildings including Headington Preparatory School and McMaster House. The height of the new flat roof is only slightly higher than the ridge of the existing pitched roof.

Residential amenity

12. There are no new windows proposed facing south towards the residential properties in The Brambles and therefore there will be no impact in terms of overlooking on these properties. The orientation of the buildings and the

distance between them means Officers have no concerns about overshadowing for these houses and their gardens.

13. The houses to the west in Brookside, whose gardens back onto the St Luke's site, are approximately 50 metres from the built form of St Luke's Hospital. The new storey will be visible from these properties but the distance between the two and the modest increase in height proposed to St Luke's, means that the change in outlook is not considered to be harmful or overbearing. The additional storey proposed on the elevation facing these properties will include bedroom and communal area windows. Due to the distances between the properties and the existing outlook from first-floor bedrooms, Officers do not consider that there will be any harm to residential amenity for properties in Brookside.
14. The existing relationship in terms of overlooking between St Luke's and Headington Preparatory School is open and not harmful. The addition of another storey is consistent with this relationship and would provide a positive outlook with plenty of activity for those rooms overlooking the school.
15. There are west-facing rooms within the sheltered accommodation at neighbouring McMaster House including two single-aspect units on the ground floor which are approximately 8.5m from the main St Luke's building. Officers have carefully considered the impact on these rooms, particularly because the rooms affected on the ground floor are single aspect and likely to be occupied for long periods every day.
16. The new storey proposed is set back slightly from the existing façade on the elevation facing McMaster House, which prevents the extension from feeling unduly overbearing on residents. It is not considered that the immediate outlook from the rooms will be harmfully altered – indeed the low hedging and small flowering trees proposed in this location are likely to improve the outlook. The proposal will not significantly alter the existing mutual overlooking.
17. The application includes shade studies for the existing and proposed massing which do indicate an increase in shadowing to the ground floor units. However, the proposal complies with the 45-degree guidance whereby a line drawn at 45-degrees from the notional cill level of the most affected units at ground floor is unbroken by the extension. This indicates that there would not be an unacceptable loss of daylight and sunlight. The ground floor units benefit from patio doors which allow more light in than standard windows. The impact on these units is therefore not considered to be harmful as to warrant refusal of the application.
18. The proposal would therefore comply with policies CP1 and CP10 of the Oxford Local Plan and HP14 of the Sites and Housing Plan in relation to impact on residential amenity for neighbouring properties.

Trees and landscaping

19. The existing site has a tarmac area at the front and side of the building which is dominated by car parking. There are various raised beds in the grounds with sparse planting, a small landscaped courtyard with tree planting just beyond the entrance and a large pleasant rear garden backing onto properties on Brookside.

20. The ODRP commented on the early iteration of the design that:

More trees and soft landscaping are needed to create a more attractive and biodiverse outdoor space amongst the car parking. ... The rear garden is a key asset and attraction which could contribute more to the identity of St Luke's Hospital and the health and well-being of all users. We suggest creating a more pleasant and defined route to this open space from the site entrance.

21. A link from the western corner of the building to the large garden is now proposed. A chevron parking arrangement has allowed for tree and hedge planting along the southern boundary. Two areas of green wall are proposed to contribute landscaping on a site constrained by car parking, as well as a green roof for both the new and existing flat roofs. Further planting and landscaping is proposed to improve the courtyard garden.

22. The application involves removal of one of the frontage trees to allow access for the vehicles delivering the pre-fabricated modules. This Leyland cypress growing from a large brick planter is covered by a Tree Protection Order. The tree is of moderate quality and has outgrown the planter now as evidenced by the structural cracks in the brickwork; thus its future contribution is probably limited. In this context its removal is acceptable subject to adequate mitigation through replacement planting.

23. The landscape plan shows an acceptable design layout and the points raised by the ODRP have been adequately and creatively addressed. The plan lacks the necessary detail, but this can be secured by condition and will need to cover the green roofs and living walls as well as the usual hard and soft landscaping. The submitted Tree Protection Plan is acceptable. The application is therefore considered to be acceptable in relation to adopted local plan policies CP1, CP11, NE15 and NE16 subject to conditions.

Highways and transport

24. The ODRP raised concerns about the high number of car parking spaces currently on site:

Whilst we do not think that the proposed amount of building on the site is problematic, we do think that the amount of car-parking now and in the future is a serious problem and undermines the success of the proposal as a whole. We urge the client to reduce the number of car parking spaces, including the car parking spaces along the western site boundary adjacent to the rear garden. It would be beneficial to develop a stronger green plan for visitors and staff as London Road is well serviced by public transport,

and a more creative car parking strategy that better utilises the variation of parking capacity at different times of the day. More trees and soft landscaping are needed to create a more attractive and biodiverse outdoor space amongst the car parking. Sustainable urban drainage for surface water run-off should be integrated where possible.

25. The maximum parking standards for nursing homes are contained within the Sites and Housing Plan Appendix 8: 1 space per 3 residents' rooms plus 1 space per 2 staff. The maximum standards for the extended St Luke's Hospital would therefore be 62 spaces. The proposed parking provision of 25 spaces is below the maximum standard and is a reduction of 6 spaces from the existing. This is considered acceptable given the site's location in a controlled parking zone and conveniently close to public transport and connections with Park and Ride facilities. The Highways Authority has commented that if demand for car parking is higher than estimated then the on-street parking controls will limit the impact of overspill parking. Whilst the proposal is likely to have no traffic impact in the peak hours the Highways Authority is concerned that the ability for visitors to park on-site could be compromised. In light of this, it is recommended that some car parking spaces are allocated for visitor use only.
26. Discussions have taken place with the Highways Authority in relation to their concerns about safe manoeuvring on site and it is considered feasible and practical to make small changes to the parking plan, such as extending the depth of each chevron parking space, to satisfy the requirements of the Highways Authority. A condition to supply a revised parking plan is therefore recommended.
27. The reduction in car parking spaces is a positive response to ODRP comments. While some areas of tarmac are retained, large areas are proposed to be paved and sustainably drained, with tree and hedge planting incorporated. The result would soften the appearance of the entrance to the site and reduce the visual dominance of car parking.
28. There are no specific cycle parking standards for nursing homes, but the cycle parking provision of 16 spaces would comply with the Council's standards for hospitals. However, given the low car parking provision, Officers consider that a higher number of secure cycle parking spaces need to be provided to support a sustainable transport strategy for the site. The Highways Authority has commented similarly. The applicant has confirmed that two showers and locker facilities are proposed at ground floor for staff which would comply with policy. Further details are recommended to be required by condition, as well as details of the cycle storage for at least 24 cycles.
29. Given the low car parking provision on site, Officers recommend that a travel information pack be compiled and supplied to staff on sustainable transport options to discourage car use. This should include cycle routes and facilities, bus connections, Park and Ride access, as well as any offers to staff such as the cycle to work scheme and travel pass loans. This is recommended as a

condition to ensure the development is acceptable in respect of parking and traffic generation in compliance with policies CP1 of the Oxford Local Plan and HP16 of the Sites and Housing Plan.

30. Given the development is located near and will make use of London Road, a strategic transport corridor, a Construction Traffic Management Plan should be required. This will need to take into account other developments and transport projects taking place in the Headington and surrounding areas.

Drainage

31. Thames Water requires a drainage strategy to be submitted and this will be required by condition. The sedum roofs proposed will reduce water surcharge into the storm water system. There were no objections raised by Oxfordshire County Council, the Lead Local Flood Authority. The proposal, subject to conditions, is considered acceptable in terms of drainage in accordance with policy NE14 of the Oxford Local Plan.

Sustainability

32. An energy statement has been included with the application demonstrating ways in which the design will seek to use energy efficiently. Sustainable drainage is proposed for new paving areas and a green roof. Details of the photovoltaics proposed on the south-west section of roof are yet to be finalised. Subject to a condition requiring such details to be submitted, the proposal is considered to comply with Policy CS9 of the Core Strategy.

Other matters

33. Land quality: This application is a major development, and therefore requires a phased risk assessment prior to commencement. Relevant conditions are recommended in compliance with policy CP22 of the Oxford Local Plan.
34. Accessibility: The new entrance would provide level access and lifts are proposed within the building. This is considered acceptable in terms of accessibility and CP13 of the Oxford Local Plan.

Conclusion:

35. The proposal is considered to be an appropriately designed extension to an existing facility and is not considered to harm the amenity of neighbouring properties. It would comply with the relevant local development plan policies. Officers therefore recommend that the East Area Planning Committee approves the application subject to conditions.

Human Rights Act 1998

Officers have considered the Human Rights Act 1998 in reaching a recommendation to grant planning permission, subject to conditions. Officers have considered the potential interference with the rights of the owners/occupiers

of surrounding properties under Article 8 and/or Article 1 of the First Protocol of the Act and consider that it is proportionate.

Officers have also considered the interference with the human rights of the applicant under Article 8 and/or Article 1 of the First Protocol caused by imposing conditions. Officers consider that the conditions are necessary to protect the rights and freedoms of others and to control the use of property in accordance with the general interest. The interference is therefore justifiable and proportionate.

Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998

Officers have considered, with due regard, the likely effect of the proposal on the need to reduce crime and disorder as part of the determination of this application, in accordance with section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. In reaching a recommendation to approve, officers consider that the proposal will not undermine crime prevention or the promotion of community safety.

Background Papers: 16/01402/FUL

Contact Officer: Nadia Robinson

Extension: 2697

Date: 25th August 2016